

Chapter 27: A New Life (1844-1845)

Martineau's spirited correspondence and reading seemed hardly affected by her first tentative experiments with mesmerism. "I have only just now received an answer from my busy brother," she reported to Howick in early July. Robert had presented a better picture of labor relations than she was aware of, judging Howick's proposed "institution" for masters and workers "unsuitable to the times." Corn Laws were to blame for trade unionism, Robert opined, as workers most feared "*uncertainty of demand*" leading to layoffs. Was Parliament sincere in scorning the Anti-Corn Law League? That would show astounding ignorance, especially by the "Premier." Lady Mary had called, and Martineau "authorized her to communicate to Lady H. [that] the strangely comfortable state in which she found me" was owing to mesmerism.¹

To Elizabeth Barrett, though, Martineau confided *personal* woes like feeling isolated, her foot not having been on the stairs "for above two years." Until then she had *occasionally* gone down to tea in the room below but found it disagreed with her. Horne must have been amused, she thought, at her "eagerness to disclaim the Dedication" to Barrett of *Life in the Sick-Room*. Though he showed a spirit of "uncommon candour and good humor," his book was poor and *her* portrait "a perfect monster."

Like Barrett, Martineau was committed to authorship. Indeed, she had labored since January at "conceiving, propounding and furthering the great plan" to issue in *Knight's Weekly Volume*. Now they had with them "the Queen, the Home Secretary, the prison and factory Inspectors, Mr. Cobden" and others. She wished Barrett knew her "inestimable . . . under-rated friend," Elisabeth Reid, whom a few had "gratuitously taken it upon themselves to look down upon." Martineau *did* know Browning and vastly admired some of his "sayings" but did not understand others. Tennyson, she read "with deep and high delight," but she regretted the general "want of simplicity" in modern poets.²

In late July, Martineau burst out to Milnes "Nobody here knows any thing of Mesmerism" (Milnes had counselled "perseverance"). Absurd offers of help required her to go to London "by Nov^{br}!" Like one of "the poor," she could see relief and help "just out of reach," for her maid's mesmerism was "degenerating into a mechanical act." "O! poor Fanny Butler!" she went on. Extracts from her volume of poems in the *Athenaeum* showed the "miserable issue of her love . . . clearly foreseen years ago." In Tynemouth, two "pretty things" had happened to Martineau since tea that evening. A friend (Reid) was to have the lower sash of her window replaced by "a single sheet of plate glass, -- a singular luxury," while a little cabin boy she once noticed (an orphan, who used to pick up coals in the haven) had brought her a piece of Gibraltar rock and was to come and tell her about an iceberg he had seen. "Small things are these for an M.P. at the end of a session," she apologized. Lately, "when within reach," she could not refrain from reading Southey's *very* fearful Cowper "when within reach." The new biography of Beau Brummell (perhaps sent by Saunders and Otley) she doubted she *could* read -- though she ought, in her "purpose to learn every sort of mind." The *French* mind, though, was hard to fathom.³

Hearing the Carlyles might come to the Robert Burns Festival at Alloway (near Stirling) on 6 August, Martineau wrote light-heartedly to Jane. "How the Amer^{ns} & other foreigners will laugh at the advert^s of the fête . . . the primary privilege & advantage specified being that the tent is--watertight!" She knew of Jane's doings from her dear sister Ellen at Liverpool, "the flower . . . the *wisest*, most nearly faultness" of their family. From

the moment Ellen was "taken out of her crib, & *shown*," she had been Martineau's "*object*," and never disappointed any "feeling (sensibility; Miss G. Jewsbury w^d say)." No matter that Ellen's face was "odd, twisted, & plain," or that her husband was "a funny looking little mortal," Ellen's voice charmed her and *his* practice went on increasing. She expected to see their children "more wisely & thoroughly trained" than any she knew. James's children, she had heard, were "something very remarkable" but that "a cast of *ambition* about all *their* doings . . . beyond their fortunes & place" worried her. She and James did not agree "about the morality of money-matters; & his new palace, & notions of living" seemed "incompatible with his calling & expectations" (James was building Park Nook in Prince's Park, Liverpool, with money advanced by the Yates sisters). Encouraged by Elisabeth Reid that her new pane was "a good *investment*, -- as plate glass can't break," Martineau touted "the luxury!" Even without the window open, she would now be able see outside, and the pane would go to her heirs. Other good news included the *Weekly Volume's* proving "one of the (not few) thorough & out & out successes of my life." What anecdotes she could tell if Jane were there! Another happy surprise was a print of Scheffer's *Mignon*, bought for her by Knight in Germany. And she had had "a beautiful letter from Emerson" telling of Margaret Fuller's "very good, & fairly successful *first* book" -- though "hasty & faulty" -- having "gained her a hearing."

"Now, my dear," she went on, did Jane "know anything of the Consumptive Hospital, at Chelsea or Brompton?" A desolate Irish gentleman she was helping had broken a blood vessel. What did Jane advise? Mazzini's "martyr soul . . . precisely what his enemies dislike & suspect," was another worry; however, she defended the home secretary Graham's opening of Mazzini's letters until she knew the reasons. Jane must "keep Eras. D. [Erasmus Darwin] up to coming . . . O! if you c^d come too!" She was "rather below par . . . from fatigue; but not in any respect really worse."⁴

(Next day, Jane wrote humorously to her cousin that *she was better*, for "Harriet Martineau has clearly shown . . . that to accept more sympathy than one's accurate due is a turpitude little short of stealing a purse"!)⁵

Greenhow recorded that Martineau "persevered" with the iodide of iron pills until "July or August" 1843. Martineau spoke in *Letters on Mesmerism* of suffering the "old distress and pain" only four times "scattered through six weeks" of the summer, when their "*séance* was prevented by visitors or other accidents." From 24 June, when Margaret first mesmerized Martineau, six weeks had now gone by.⁶

A flurry of letters to Elizabeth Barrett in August touched on Barrett's "approaching vols.," Reid's calling on Barrett and the consumptive young Irishman, I.W. Langtree who was staying at 10 Egremont Place, New Road -- for whom Barrett sent two donations. "There he lies," Martineau wrote on 16 August, "forbidden to move and speak, -- ice betwⁿ the shoulders, -- and the case perfectly desperate." By 22 August, Langtree was to be moved to the hospital, but the "heavy medical expenses" shocked her, for "the little raised was never meant to go in regular fees into a physician's pocket." By the 27th, Langtree was in a sanatorium, "not far from death," his residence being "paid for, for a month."

Receiving Barrett's new volumes led Martineau to repent her promise to criticize "such materials" as she wished Barrett's "mode of expression were simpler, -- freer from -- not so much obscurity as manner." Now she had another doubt: Barrett's "almost absurd" estimate of *her*. Her falling out with Catharine Sedgwick, whom she was "disposed to love and honour," came from the "gross praise" that caused her to be afraid to open Sedgwick's letters. Since then, she had learned that "flattery was no security, for common justice."

However, Sedgwick had apparently "changed back again during the last summer of dear Dr. Channing's life, -- *his* opinions being all-powerful with her."⁷

On 25 August, Martineau thanked Jane Carlyle for kindness to "poor M^r Langtree." Milnes and Carlyle's good friend John Forster had helped too, while Erasmus Darwin could give her "an acc^t of the case originally." Not knowing how "dearest Jenny" regarded mesmerism, "its seriousness [and] deep solemnity," Martineau had delayed writing -- but it was "as true as the principle of gravitation." The Huttons knew about it from Darwin. From Jane, she could no longer keep the fact that she was "free from almost all suffering . . . espec^y within a fortnight." Though she had believed in mesmerism for years, her family scorned it -- and she could not now tell James "one word . . . because he ridicules the whole thing." Her "loving maid Marg^t" had done it: after the "soothing . . . came *hunger*." She stopped the iodine, then the "aperients [laxatives], -- then, by degrees, opiates" (now reduced to one half) and had "left off all other medicines whatever." She had "twice been upstairs, -- one flight, to my maid's room, whence there is an enchanting view."⁸

In *Letters on Mesmerism*, Martineau claimed she had consulted "two friends in London" about mesmerism the winter before, one a woman. Yet "one whose intellect I was accustomed to look up to" declared a belief in mesmerism to be madness (James?). Saying nothing about mesmerism to Crabb Robinson, Martineau reported on Cristina, the Newcastle girl, who was happy at school and whose *deafness* had improved. The case of the "Irish gent^l," however, was closing. He had become entirely reliant on *her* for "guidance & comfort," and just five weeks were provided for at the sanatorium, at a guinea a week.

Next, Martineau retailed an anecdote about members of the SDUK disagreeing over her early tales -- and she boasted of the success of Knight's *Weekly Volume*. Book clubs were being established "among the workies," the men *reading* after their dinners and so on. "Do you know," she burst out next, "I have been sadly disappointed in Arnold's *Life*" for his prejudice about Jews and "terrible blindness about the principles of religious liberty." Just now she was "watching the gleams & shadows, & the surface of the sea" with thoughts of "dear M^rs Reid," who was leaving next day on her travels after a happy fortnight at Tynemouth.⁹

(When Greenhow examined Martineau on 4 September, he noted her uterine symptoms subsiding and that "quietude and repose" had succeeded to "restlessness and irritability." On 11 September, he recorded that "Miss M. continues comfortable," having that day been "in the garden for some time laid on a sofa cushion.")¹⁰

Sometime earlier, Martineau had written to Fox that he might "possibly like to know something of Edward Cayley" (Fox was now a paid lecturer and writer for the Anti-Corn Law League). Just as she was packing for America, Cayley warned her against writing anti-Corn Law stories -- yet the distinguished Judge Story had spent a whole morning over *Sowers not Reapers* and was "wonderstricken" at the operations of the Corn Laws, declaring that Americans should read the tale twice.

Retailing other political judgments, Martineau complained that she was "always overdone with correspond^{ce}," but her condition was "just so much better as prolonged quiet & an ascertain^{mt} of the better opiate system can make it."¹¹

In July, Martineau gossiped about politicians, disdaining Macaulay. Like many sons of philanthropists, he was "heartless," unsound and "often wicked." In September, she told Fox she "could say much about the League" but instead wished to tell of "the great change w^h has taken place in my state." Fox had never been "among the scoffers" at mesmerism, she knew. "Florry's case" (Fox's deaf son) would have made him open to "enquiry, -- such

enquiry as M^r [Henry] Hallam lately told me here, & as many other valued friends assure me, does always end in belief." To "expose the fallacy" of current denouncers of mesmerism, she had kept a "close & full journal." Until June, her family at Newcastle ("& also James") had been "vehemently contemptuous," and then "suddenly . . . all obstacles cleared away" (her brother-in-law Higginson at Liverpool had "twice operated on patients who felt no pain, -- being in the mesmeric sleep"). Indeed, after her maid's first try at mesmerizing her, she had "walked about [her] rooms & chattered."

(Perhaps squeamishly, Martineau failed to mention the name of the autodidact Hall, who often demonstrated his powers before large, mixed audiences. In 1845 Hall published an account of being "persuaded" by Greenhow -- who chaired his lecture at Newcastle -- to mesmerize an unidentified sufferer. On the train to North Shields, Hall first learned who the patient was. "But, so far as I remember," Hall vouchsafed, "Mr. Greenhow did not on that or any other occasion give me the slightest idea that a cure of Miss Martineau's disease had already commenced . . . two months before." After two visits, Hall recorded, he saw Martineau six or seven times to see that his instructions "were duly carried out" by the maid, and those *séances* continued until 6 September.)

The maid Margaret's ministrations were supposedly kept secret, Martineau went on to Fox, lest she have a relapse. Greenhow confirmed that the "displacement [of] internal organs" had given way, though "not the tumour itself." Then just as she and her maid were wishing for "guidance & reinforcement . . . a capital mesmerist" offered to come to her, "the widow of a clergyman, -- an ardent, benevolent woman, in full health & hope, -- once a curious somnambule, & long experienced."

Martineau had never "slept" during the *séances*, but now she felt a deepening darkness, "in full lamp light & daylight," with increasing "languor." Today, sunshine and blue sky outside would again prompt her to "send down her cushions," but nothing more touching could happen than Margaret's "excessive agitation in lending me her Sunday bonnet," *Martineau* having given away all her "outdoor apparatus."¹²

On receiving Elizabeth Barrett's "vols," Martineau returned a long critique and vaunted the success of mesmerism. "*It is so. There is a change. The hopeless symptom has partially given way!*" If needed, she would "answer *any* questions, give *any* history, to your sist^r, or father, or to M^r Kenyon [the Barretts' family friend]." With the *Weekly Volume* thriving and no writing chores to engross her, Martineau had scrutinized Barrett's poems with care. At first, she was overwhelmed: "I cannot . . . say at all adequately what I think of the (to me) best poems in this collection . . . my emotions are too strong to be recorded." Transported by some of the shorter poems, she saw at once that Barrett had made "an immense advance on the former volume." Yet while "A Drama of Exile" (on Adam and Eve the first day away from Eden) had grand and moving ideas, it seemed long drawn out. "Is it that there is a sameness in each person . . . ?" Or did the fault lie with *her*? Unhappy at dwelling on technical faults, Martineau still censured Barrett's rhymes as sometimes "too bad" (Barrett's attempt at originality and freshness included double rhymes, slant rhymes and such). Yet she could only thank Barrett for making her a "partaker in this sweet & elevating spiritual stimulus & gratification," and she wished she knew Barrett's father.¹³

(On 21 September, Greenhow confirmed his patient's progress:

Miss M. reports favourably in all respects . . . Opiate reduced to a very small dose. Yesterday walked round the Castle yard; to-day, the same, with the addition of a walk to the Haven [a steep climb of a fourth of a mile each way]).¹⁴

Answering by proxy a note from George Combe, Martineau affirmed her disease was slowly being driven back as it had once advanced. Because she did not *sleep* during mesmerism and was not a somnambule, she was not a good candidate for his experiment.

(Hall heard from Combe, Robert Chambers and Catherine Crowe at Edinburgh that "Miss Martineau's cure was becoming a topic of conversation in select circles."¹⁵ On 8 October, Greenhow recorded: "Miss M. informed me that she can now take long walks -- to-day, two miles and a half." Having "discontinued opiates for five days," she slept well only after taking "a small quantity of warm brandy and water").¹⁶

To Crabb Robinson, Martineau admitted being "in the hardest part of my scramble out of the pit," the "final relinquishment [of opiates being] *very disagreeable*." By "basking on the rocks" she could take long walks and not be "over-powered by the wide sky after 4 1/2 years of bed & sofa."¹⁷

Probably on the same day, Martineau declared excitedly to Fox that pre-cognition had been proven by the maid Jane! "*Mesmerism [was] true to the full extent claimed*." Now she was resolved "to throw my whole weight of my character, intellectual & moral, into my testimony [that] human beings have, under certain conditions, a power of Prevision & Insight."

Just now she was "so occupied & *used up*" with the daily routine of treatment "& with the case of a Somnambule in the house," she could write only to her mother, though she saw her duty, "clear & unquestionable," to report her experience. Of many awful things seen in her life, none matched those she had witnessed "these last few days, -- the prophecy & insight of a simple, truthful girl, whom I have known . . . for nearly five years." Once Jane had been put to sleep, Martineau secretly took down her words as Jane prescribed for herself and humbly took orders. Martineau hoped within days to learn precisely the nature of her disease, "& how to complete the cure." Greenhow was deeply impressed and was "about to introduce the practice of Mesmerism into the Newcastle Infirmary." Last week, Lady Mary Lambton found Martineau "so wholly altered in appearance, -- in countenance, complexion & figure," she "sounded" her about "going to Lambton." Yet she must first investigate this "revelation of laws of our nature w^h must do more to change human relations than any influence since society began." Next, she described the sensation of walking to a headland, when "M^{rs} Wynyard just put her hand on my forehead . . . & at once . . . every object [was] dressed in phosphoric light" [seemingly an erotic experience]. As further proof of a mesmerist's powers, last Sunday Robert Chambers begged M^{rs} Wynyard to try upon him here; & in 7 minutes, he was deprived of all power of speech & motion, sight &c, -- tho' a more robust & shrewd & self-possessed Scot you will not find.¹⁸

Martineau's letter to the *Athenaeum*, "Mesmeric Experience," described her case. A second letter, "Mesmeric Observation," told the story of Jane, who had "for six years been subject to frequent severe pain in the left temple [and was] under the care of several doctors [and] at one time a patient at the Eye Infirmary at Newcastle."

On 1 October, Martineau's friend (probably Wynyard) learned from *her* maid that she had mesmerized Jane the day before and induced her to sleep for twenty minutes (Jane's susceptibility as an uneducated young person made her an ideal subject for experiment). Jane also agreed to have her experiences published. As the *séances* proceeded, "[i]t soon became evident that one of her strongest powers was the discernment of disease, its condition and remedies" (i.e., that Jane was a somnambule). Jane seemed not only to correctly describe the progress and decline of Martineau's illness,

but recommended the "ale at dinner, and half wine-glass full of brandy in water at night" that allowed Martineau to sleep soundly without taking laudanum. By Saturday, 12 October, Jane was seeing unearthly "gleams" and defining the "soul." On the 14th, she did not come owing to the possible drowning of a cousin in a shipwreck. Next day, she went for a drive with Martineau, then on an *errand* and in the evening, "came straight up to us for her *séance*." Two gentlemen, one an American, witnessed Jane's testimony that the ship's crew had been saved.

Avowedly quoting Jane's exact words, Martineau insisted she was not only a somnambule but a clairvoyant, and she described Jane's acts when mesmerized, including having her arm wrenched by a sceptical gentleman visitor.¹⁹

(Aware of Martineau's treatment, Carlyle had sent her "a little Book" through Moxon; with Charles Buller, he weighed her cure and "awful visions." In November, he exploded "Miss Martineau is sunk to the lips in animal magnetism; actually very *greatly* mended of her ailment, can 'walk out five miles' &c: but the upshot for her also *garbedenklich* [very precarious]!"

Of other London friends, Macready was staggered by Martineau's "incredulity on Mesmerism" and wondered if she was "in her clear senses." Richard, meanwhile, sent "dribbles" of testimonial contributions that included "a Post office order for £3.0.9" hoping she could get the money without "the trouble you had on a former occasion").²⁰

In her autobiography, Martineau contended that she had been "compelled to publish . . . 'Letters on Mesmerism'" owing to "more than my share of persecution for the offense of recovery from a hopeless illness by a new method." Correspondence supporting her and "ridiculing the doctors for their repugnance" appeared in newspapers, while Hall remained "honourably silent." To correct mistakes, she had sought a "scientific journal" in which to publish a narrative of the facts. Having approached the staff of the *Athenaeum* knowing that Charles Dilke, the editor, was an "unbeliever" she vowed she would take no money but specified that her articles must be printed "unaltered." Indeed, she boasted, the "six letters that I sent carried six numbers of the *Athenaeum* through three editions".

(Martineau's first five "letters" of 12-28 November led to "a string of comments by the editor, insulting and slanderous to the last degree," followed by her reply, 29 December, plus further statements). Continuing the account in her autobiography, Martineau detailed steps she had taken to preserve Jane's credit as a clairvoyant -- and to keep her from being mistaken for a "loose" Jane Ann of Shields.²¹)

By a happy coincidence, on the day of her third letter to the *Athenaeum* (21 November), Martineau thanked Moxon for a liberal cheque resulting from their "contingency" agreement on *Life in the Sick-Room* twelve months earlier. She was off to Newcastle, had walked about and was less deaf than for twenty years past. People would likely say she had been shamming or imagining herself so deaf for twenty-four years! Moxon answered by proposing to reprint her "Letters" to the *Athenaeum* as a pamphlet. "[D]o," she answered after five days, while offering to write a preface.²²

(Hearing about Jane in Tynemouth, Jane Carlyle sniffed "this girl of Harriets [sic] seems half diseased -- half makebelieving -- I think it a horrible blasphemy they are there perpetuating in *exploiting* that poor girl for their idle purposes of curiosity!" With the girl she quite agreed that "had Mrs Winyard [sic] lived in an earlier age of the world she would have been burnt for a witch." Mesmerism, Jane added to her uncle, was a "damnable sort of tempting of Providence." Seemingly still in shock two weeks later, Jane groaned: "Harriet

Martineau expects that the whole system of medicine is going to be flung to the dogs presently, and that henceforth instead of Physicians we are to have *Magnetizers!*")²³

In late November, Martineau quizzed Bulwer: "who do you think is my mesmerist?" Mrs. Wynyard was in high spirits, and *her* "one ear, *dead* for 24 years," had partially regained hearing. Owing to "the disgust of detailing things about oneself," her first two papers in the *Athenaeum* had required courage. In three weeks, she would come to the "morality of the matter" (in the fifth letter, to be titled "Freedom of Acceptance"). From the present "visits of physicians, and the letters of the sick and suffering . . . and their doctors," she was leading a strange life. Once the rush was over, she would go the Lakes to stay "at the house of an arch Mesmerist." She knew Bulwer hated the *Athenaeum*, but she had chosen it "for its former enmity to mesmerism."²⁴ On 4 December, Martineau told Spencer Hall she felt "*nothing* whatever of her late complaints."²⁵

(Two days earlier, Greenhow's examination showed retroversion of the uterus and two "membranous pendicules" still present, though renewed activity had apparently cured her "abdominal distension." Greenhow claimed to have known all along there were "no symptoms of malignant disease," but the patient "never willingly listened" to such suggestions. Advocates of mesmerism would no doubt support Martineau's view of her case, but "the experienced practitioner, carefully distinguishing the *post hoc* from the *propter hoc*," would see that a powerful stimulus had helped her shake off the nervous symptoms connected with the disease. Hall had responded slyly to Greenhow's pamphlet saying that if Martineau had recovered under ordinary treatment, her medical practitioner would have been "exceedingly proud of the case," rather than admitting her condition in December to be "*but the natural sequel* of progressive improvement begun in, or antecedent to, the month of April").²⁶

On Thursday, 12 December, Martineau wrote jubilantly to Crabb Robinson that Greenhow "took leave of my case' last Friday." In the interim *her* "business [had been] most like a Prime Minister's," the postman tying up her "letters & papers in bundles." Doctors wrote, and the "Queen Dow^{rs} court" were interested; one of the "Maids of Honour" was "in correspond^{ce}" with her, and "Lord & Lady Barrington (one of the "Queen Dow^{rs} ladies) had come to see our Somnambule." She would see Robinson when she got to the W.R. Gregs' with Elizabeth Wynyard and Jane, who was going as her maid.²⁷

Martineau was worried that Dilke would not print another letter on Jane's identifying individuals and places near Tynemouth, but where else to send it? *She* kept the Queen and physicians informed, while her doctor stayed away. Friends liked her *Letters on Mesmerism*, and she had added a preface (dated 19 December) explaining the inclusion of Jane's somnambulism and briefly surveying mesmerism in Britain. Then on 28 December, the *Athenaeum* charged that Martineau was an incompetent witness. In "A Few Words by Way of Comment on Miss Martineau's Statement," Dilke scoffed that she may have *felt* better after mesmerism, but *was* she better? Greenhow's report -- forced on him by the misapprehensions of the medical journals -- had been received within the hour, and the editor was incredulous at the belief in Jane's clairvoyance.²⁸

James's recorded letter from Martineau of 30 December failed to note her imbroglio with the *Athenaeum*. He mentioned only Arthur Penrhyn Stanley's thanks for his "Endeavours" sent through her, her delight in Greg's review of the *Life and Correspondence of Thomas Arnold* in the *Westminster* (arguing that the editor should not have altered it) and her "indignant contempt over the church squabbles about vestments and ritual."

For relief, she had turned to such "pure productions as Miss Barrett's poems" and to the (unknown) author of *Vestiges of the Natural History of Creation*, who had sent her his book -- was it Babbage's? ("I positively disavow it," James wrote.) Other tidbits for James concerned Peel, Sydney Smith ("very ill") and Jeffery. Lord and Lady Barrington had called on her "with plenty of mesmeric news," and Lord Morpeth was coming to "gossip . . . about it for a day."²⁹

Probably in response to a *tract* sent by Robert Chambers, Martineau answered that she and Wynyard had no time "to eat, sleep & walk," much less to read or write letters. "Your Wages N^o was duly read & appreciated by Lord Howick, Co^l Grey & L^y Mary Lambton, - long ago," she assured him, and had an "enormous circulation." She thanked him for the account of "Greatrakes" (a seventeenth-century healer). Feeling she had recovered fully under Wynyard's hands, she wished to write to Combe about the "Phrenological evidences w^h now appear, -- clear & decisive -- in our chief somnambule." *They* must be added to the second edition of her pamphlet, "likely to be wanted immediately." Excitedly, she described "M^{rs} W's hand being on Immitation" (a phrenological spot, on Jane Arrowsmith's head), when Jane understood phrases in French, German and Italian -- the same thing occurring when "Language" was touched. On another occasion, Jane reported "a bright light streaming from the Mesmerist's fingers." The clergymen, physicians, officers, lords and ladies who had seen her were convinced.³⁰

On 4 January 1845, Dilke -- no doubt reluctant to lose the flood of extra readers -- duly printed Martineau's sixth letter to the *Athenaeum*: "Miss Martineau in Reply to our Few Words of Comment," with *added* comments. Thereafter, a weekly series of statements and counterstatements by participants and commentators on mesmerism and clairvoyance, "Miss Martineau and Mesmerism," ran from 15 March to 12 April. On 6 April, Martineau declared from Birmingham: "I here close my communications to the *Athenaeum*."³¹

Seeing Greenhow's pamphlet (*Medical Report of the Case of Miss H--- M---*) for the first time on 7 January, Martineau had sputtered to James that the report was "not *professional* or in Latin, but in plain popular English." Greenhow had no sanction to publish the report and "ought to furnish to Dr. Elliotson a private account of his view of the case." Astounded at Greenhow's "mistake," she told Moxon he should make it known that she was not accountable for the report. Still fuming on 11 January, she sent James a long statement of Greenhow's acts.

(Trying to be fair, James noted that Greenhow's publication, "as a spontaneous act . . . was repulsive," but that Harriet's publication of her recovery "before the disease was defined" compelled him to reply in a public forum. "On Monday morning she goes to Wansfell," he added, "her lodgings being paid for two months to come; thence to Lenton, and then to Robert's for a long visit").³²

¹ HM to Howick, 3 July 1844, *CL* 2: 324-26.

² HM to Elizabeth Barrett, 11 July 1844, *HM/FL* 79-82; for Horne's *A New Spirit of the Age*, see last chapter.

³ HM to Milnes, 29 July 1844, *TLC Houghton* 16⁶⁹ (partly pbd., *CL* 2: 327); Frances Anne Butler, *Poems* (dedicated to Katharine [sic] Sedgwick; Philadelphia: John Penington, 1844, and London: [Wiley & Putnam] H. G. Clarke, 1844; Butler's mildly sad descriptive lyrics merited two reviews in the *Athenaeum* praising her hard thinking and robust feelings);

Athen., 27 July and 3 August 1844: 687-88 and 712-13; Robert Southey, *The Work of William Cowper, Esq., comprising his Poems, Correspondence, and Translations. With a life of the author* . . . 15 vols. (London: Baldwin & Cradock, 1835-37; the account of Cowper's depression and madness evidently upset Martineau); William Jesse, *The Life of George Brummell, Esq., commonly called Beau Brummell* . . . (London: Saunders & Otley, 1844); the hard to fathom French mind may have included Deleuze on mesmerism.

⁴ HM to JWC, 4 August 1844, *CL* 2: 327-29; Geraldine Jewsbury, Jane's novelist friend; Jane Carlyle described Park Nook as a "pie-crust sort of house, with all the 'curiosities and niceties' that a Unitarian Minister could wish": JWC to TC, [10 August 1845], *Carlyle Letters* 19: 137-40; Margaret Fuller, *Summer on the Lakes, in 1843* (Boston: C. C. Little and New York: C. S. Francis, 1844), comprising travel notes, poems and quoted passages on Niagara, the Great Lakes, Mackinaw, Chicago and the prairies).

⁵ JWC to Jeannie Welsh, [5? August 1844], *Carlyle Letters* 18: 170-71.

⁶ Greenhow 16; Martineau claimed confusingly that by 1 May 1845 she "had left off all drugs for ten months, except the opiates, which had [been reduced] and now discontinued for half a year" (*Auto.* 2: 212); *Letters on Mesmerism* (see note 19) 11.

⁷ HM to Elizabeth Barrett, [8, 16, 22 and 27 August 1844], *HM/FL* 84-86, 88, 89-90 and 93; Elizabeth Barrett, *Poems. In Two Volumes* (London: Moxon, 1844) raised Barrett's reputation to that of a major poet and prompted Robert Browning's first letter to her; Martineau's puritanical streak seemed to surface in comparisons of her to other women.

⁸ HM to JWC, 25 August [1844], *CL* 2, 331-32.

⁹ *Letters on Mesmerism* 5-6 and 3; HM to HCR, 25 August 1844, *HM/FL* 90-91 and *CL* 2: 329-31 (for Arnold's *Life*, see note 29).

¹⁰ Greenhow 18-19.

¹¹ HM to WJF, 23 April [1844], *CL* 2: 284-86 (Fox was now addressed as "Esq" rather than "Rev^d"); see E.S. Cayley, *Reasons for the Formation of the Agricultural Protection Society, Addressed to the Industrious Classes* . . . (London: John Ollivier, 1844); *Sowers not Reapers*, Martineau's Corn-Law tale in *Illustrations of Political Economy*.

¹² HM to WJF, [24] July 1844, *BANC* [Box 2] 77; 15 September 1844, *HM/FL* 95-97; Hall's statements obviously weakened Martineau's claim that mesmerism had "cured" her (Spencer T. Hall, *Mesmeric Experiences* [London: H. Bailliere and J. Ollivier, 1845] 63-75), while Martineau claimed to be unwilling to implicate Hall in case of a relapse (*Auto.* 2: 195); the arrival of Elizabeth (Mrs. Montague) Wynyard, whose services were obtained through Martineau's future friend and collaborator Atkinson, must have caused a considerable stir.

¹³ HM to Elizabeth Barrett, 16 September 1844, *HM/FL* 197-100; thrilled by Martineau's close reading and praise, Barrett misinterpreted her mesmeric cure as coming from the "spirit world" (when Anna Jameson called on Barrett, the two writers talked over Martineau's mesmerism: see Forster, *Elizabeth Barrett Browning* 131-32 and 135).

¹⁴ Greenhow 19-20.

¹⁵ HM to [George] Combe, 27 September 1844, *HM/FL* 100; Hall, *Mesmeric Experiences* 74.

¹⁶ Greenhow 20.

¹⁷ HM to HCR, [8?] October 1844, *DWL* corr. 1844 89a (partly pbd. *CL* 2: 336).

¹⁸ HM to WJF, 8 October 1844, *HM/FL* 10-105.

¹⁹ "Miss Martineau on Mesmerism," *Athen.* 23 November (letter of 12 November), 30 November (letter of 20 November), 7 December (letter of 21 November), 14 December (letter of 23 November), 21 December (letter of 28 November), 1844: 1070-72, 1093-94, 1117-18, 1144-45 and 1173-74 (rptd. as "Mesmeric Experience," "Mesmeric Observation,"

"Spirit of Inquiry," "Spirit of Conviction" and "Freedom of Acceptance," *Letters on Mesmerism* 1-18, 19-38, 39-46, 47-57 and 58-65); Martineau's preface to the second edition (i-xii, dated 19 December 1844) pleads early ignorance and late awareness of mesmeric practice and recommends the *Zoist* and eight or nine helpful publications; Martineau's appendix details the phrenological experiments on Jane (*Letters on Mesmerism* 67-70); see Winter 56-57.

²⁰ TC to [Moxon], 5 September 1844 and TC to John A. Carlyle, 1 November 1844, *Carlyle Letters* 18: 196-97 and 255-56; *Macready*, Toynbee [diary entry for 6 November 1844] 2: 276; Richard Martineau to HM, 19 October 1844, BUL MS Harriet Martineau 1231.

²¹ See note 19; "A Few Words by Way of Comment on Miss Martineau's Statement," *Athen.*, 28 December 1844: 1198-99, and *Auto.* 2: 194-202).

²² HM to Moxon, 21 and 26 November [1844], Monday evening [December 1844], *HM/FL* 113, 113-14, 114-15 (Dilke, editor of the *Athenaeum*, at first "sent his lawyer" and then "stooped to say" she did not know whether he had not given money to a charity in her name--but failed to name the charity).

²³ JWC to John Welsh, 13 December [1844], and JWC to Mary Russell, [30] December [1844], *Carlyle Letters* 18: 282-85 and 306-308.

²⁴ HM to Bulwer, 27 November 1844, *CL* 2: 337-38.

²⁵ HM to Spencer Hall, 4 December 1845, and Spencer Hall to the "*Atlas*," 27 January 1845, in Spencer Hall, *Mesmeric Experiences* 74-75.

²⁶ Greenhow 20-24.

²⁷ HM to HCR, 12 December 1844, *HM/FL* 118-19; William Rathbone Greg, youngest son of Cheshire mill-owner Samuel Greg, had called on Martineau with his wife while Wynyard was there and invited her to his home near Windermere to continue her therapy; Martineau named him "one of the very first inquirers into mesmerism in England" (*Auto.* 2: 202-203).

²⁸ HM to Moxon, Wednesday [25 December 1844], *HM/FL* 121-22; "A Few Words by Way of Comment on Miss Martineau's Statement," *Athen.* 28 December 1844: 1198-99.

²⁹ HM to JM, 30 December 1844, *HM/FL* 506-507; for *Endeavors after the Christian Life*, see chap. 25, note 33; W.R. Greg, [rev.] "Life and Correspondence of Thomas Arnold, D. D., late Head Master of Rugby School, &c, &c," *WR* 42 (December 1844): 363-81 (William Edward Hickson was editor of the *Westminster Review*); Robert Chambers, *Vestiges of the Natural History of Creation* (London: J. Churchill, 1844; Chambers kept his authorship secret to avoid harm to the Chambers' publishing business).

³⁰ HM to [Robert] Chambers, 31 December [1844], *CL* 2: 338-39.

³¹ *Letters on Mesmerism* (second edition) 1845; "Miss Martineau in Reply to our Few Words of Comment," *Athen.* 4 January 1845: 14 [ff'd. by comment] 14-15; "Miss Martineau and Mesmerism," *Athen.*, 15 March 1845: 268-69 [letter from John Forbes, statement by Dr. J., statement addressed to Dr. J.]; 22 March 1845: 290-91 [letter from HM of 17 March (Birmingham) and comment]; 29 March 1845: 310-11 [letter from HM of 23 March 1845 (Birmingham), letter to HM from A.P.W. including E. Headlam Greenhow's notes, account of Mrs. Arrowsmith's replies to HM, Matthew Nottingham's letter from London of 19 December and HM's reply to him, etc., the editor now complaining that space was being wasted]; 5 April 1845: 333-335 [Dr. Joseph Brown's reply of 31 March 1845 (Bishopwearmouth, Sunderland), letter from E. Headlam Greenhow of 1 April (Tynemouth), note from Matthew Nottingham of 1 April (London), the editor having shortened the last, says Mrs. Montague Wynyard denies Jane's clairvoyance]; 12 April 1845: 361-63 [letter from Martineau of 6 April (Birmingham), Mrs. Arrowsmith's statement, Jane's statement, Mrs.

Halliday's statement, letter from Arthur Ryland who took last three statements on 3 April and supports Martineau, editor now resenting Martineau's "sneer" at the *Athenaeum* and restating evidence to disprove Jane's clairvoyance, statement of Barbara Cole--maid of the owner of the ship that sank--confirming that the sinking must have been known to Jane before the séance]; [rev.] *Notes on a few more Trials with the Mesmerists in a second search for Clairvoyance*, by John Forbes, M.D., etc., mentioned Martineau's failure to see Jane's clairvoyance was false, 13 September 1845: 901; Martineau may identify Jane's chronic illness and susceptibility to extreme states of consciousness with her own (*Auto.* 2: 201-2).

³² HM to JM, 7 and 11 January 1845, *HM/FL* 507 and 507 (Dr. John Elliotson, former professor of medicine at University College, London, chief advocate of the use of mesmerism and somnambulism in medical practice); HM to Moxon, Wednesday night [January 1845], *CL* 2: 342; James must mean Martineau's lodgings at Tynemouth; after a month with the Gregs, Martineau stayed with Catherine Turner at Lenton, near Nottingham, then with Robert's family in Birmingham.